

**To:** Bridgers, George[Bridgers.George@epa.gov]; Brode, Roger[Brode.Roger@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Thurman, James[Thurman.James@epa.gov]; Avey, Lance[Avey.Lance@epa.gov]; Fox, Tyler[Fox.Tyler@epa.gov]  
**From:** Hawkins, Andy  
**Sent:** Thur 2/25/2016 3:13:33 PM  
**Subject:** RE: SO2 Ambient Air Quality Characterization

How about 2:30pm CST Tuesday... cuts my call with Kirk short but works better than 10am CST. I'll try and prepare a summary of key issues I see between now and then.

Thanks,

Andy

Andy Hawkins

EPA Region 7

11201 Renner Boulevard

Lenexa, Kansas 66219

(913) 551-7179 office

[hawkins.andy@epa.gov](mailto:hawkins.andy@epa.gov)

**From:** Bridgers, George  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 25, 2016 9:03 AM  
**To:** Hawkins, Andy <[hawkins.andy@epa.gov](mailto:hawkins.andy@epa.gov)>; Brode, Roger <[Brode.Roger@epa.gov](mailto:Brode.Roger@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Thurman, James <[Thurman.James@epa.gov](mailto:Thurman.James@epa.gov)>; Avey, Lance <[Avey.Lance@epa.gov](mailto:Avey.Lance@epa.gov)>; Fox, Tyler <[Fox.Tyler@epa.gov](mailto:Fox.Tyler@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: SO2 Ambient Air Quality Characterization

Thanks... yes, the FOIA absolutely impacts me / us... and may require that I compile all the emails that I have exchanged with all ROs on ADJ\_U\* and LOWWIND3 related to SO2 designation sources... which could be numerous and to no avail, the synopsis is that neither of the beta options can be used in the regulatory context without justification and RO approval. We have a approval on ADJ\_U\* with R10 and soon others, but there has been nothing on LOWWIND3 because there hadn't been a full formal peer-review of the option or facilities hadn't performed an adequate application specific performance eval.

Exemption 5:  
Deliberative

have a call next Tuesday afternoon... gives him and me 2 full business days (tomorrow is our normal CDO) to review the material. Please let me know if Tuesday is not workable... if it is, then we're clear on the calendar after 3p EST / 2P CST... or could maybe squeeze in a call at 11a EST / 10a CST.

-G

---

George M. Bridgers, CPM, Environmental Scientist  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards  
AQAD - Air Quality Modeling Group  
109 TW Alexander Drive  
Room C431B - Mail Drop C439-01  
Research Triangle Park, NC 27711  
Phone: 919-541-5563  
Fax: 919-541-0044

**From:** Hawkins, Andy  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 24, 2016 9:02 PM  
**To:** Bridgers, George <[Bridgers.George@epa.gov](mailto:Bridgers.George@epa.gov)>; Brode, Roger <[Brode.Roger@epa.gov](mailto:Brode.Roger@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Thurman, James <[Thurman.James@epa.gov](mailto:Thurman.James@epa.gov)>; Avey, Lance <[Avey.Lance@epa.gov](mailto:Avey.Lance@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: SO2 Ambient Air Quality Characterization

FYI - Another 301 pages related to Labadie LOWWIND3... it does contain some additional

onsite information not included in the last submittal I sent. At this point we have 3 beta request submittals for the same source, each containing a bit more information and data referenced include onsite met and SO2 monitors both current and historic, WRF+MMIF(a maybe on the MMIF as they did something with the WRF and AERMOD), numerous AERMOD runs, including AERMOD runs in debug mode. I will be requesting the actual onsite data hopefully soon. I've also included the FOIA request from this same company which may impact you.

Thanks,

Andy

Andy Hawkins

EPA Region 7

11201 Renner Boulevard

Lenexa, Kansas 66219

(913) 551-7179 office

[hawkins.andy@epa.gov](mailto:hawkins.andy@epa.gov)

**From:** Jay, Michael

**Sent:** Wednesday, February 24, 2016 4:21 PM

**To:** Algae-Eakin, Amy <[Algae-Eakin.Amy@epa.gov](mailto:Algae-Eakin.Amy@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Weber, Rebecca <[Weber.Rebecca@epa.gov](mailto:Weber.Rebecca@epa.gov)>; Hawkins, Andy <[hawkins.andy@epa.gov](mailto:hawkins.andy@epa.gov)>; Avey, Lance <[Avey.Lance@epa.gov](mailto:Avey.Lance@epa.gov)>; Peter, David <[peter.david@epa.gov](mailto:peter.david@epa.gov)>; Brown, Steven <[Brown.Steven@epa.gov](mailto:Brown.Steven@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** Fwd: SO2 Ambient Air Quality Characterization

Amy,

We will need to address. This is now the third submittal from ameren.

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Whitworth, Steve C" <[SWhitworth@ameren.com](mailto:SWhitworth@ameren.com)>  
**To:** "Jay, Michael" <[Jay.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Jay.Michael@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** "Moore, Kyra" <[kyra.moore@dnr.mo.gov](mailto:kyra.moore@dnr.mo.gov)> ([kyra.moore@dnr.mo.gov](mailto:kyra.moore@dnr.mo.gov))"  
<[kyra.moore@dnr.mo.gov](mailto:kyra.moore@dnr.mo.gov)>  
**Subject:** SO2 Ambient Air Quality Characterization

Mike – Ameren submits the request below that is accompanied by the attached file related to the air quality modeling characterization for ambient SO2 concentrations in the vicinity of the Labadie Energy Center.

On December 9, 2015, the Missouri Department of Natural Resources submitted to Region VII the attached demonstration materials that have been prepared in accordance with the requirements of Section 3.2 of the Guideline on Air Quality Models (Appendix W).

Importantly, such alternative model demonstration materials include a peer-reviewed scientific article prepared by AECOM and published in the Journal of Air and Waste Management. Additional articles on the Low Wind Speed have been prepared by AECOM and are expected to be published shortly in that scientific journal. The report that provides the basis for the use of the low wind speed option has been previously provided to MDNR and Region VII and is attached again to this e-mail.

As USEPA Air Quality Assessment Division noted in its recent memorandum ( “Clarification of the Approval Process for Regulatory Application of the AERMOD Modeling System Beta Options”, issued December 10, 2015); see [http://www3.epa.gov/ttn/scram/guidance/clarification/AERMOD\\_Beta\\_Options\\_Memo-20151210.pdf](http://www3.epa.gov/ttn/scram/guidance/clarification/AERMOD_Beta_Options_Memo-20151210.pdf)

"the incorporation of beta options is beneficial to the entire stakeholder community, because these new models can be scientifically reviewed and fully evaluated by the community (thereby shortening the time it might take to otherwise formally propose and adopt the new model option into a preferred model)". This is particularly true in the case of the Ameren Labadie Energy Center where, depending upon the AERMOD options chosen, the model demonstrates either attainment or nonattainment with the SO2 standard. Our modeling expert in this matter, Mr. Robert Paine of AECOM, made presentations at both the Tenth and Eleventh Modeling Conferences sponsored by EPA and described how the AERMOD model contains a bias to over predict under stable/light wind conditions. EPA’s proposed rulemaking acknowledges this over prediction bias, and its proposed low-wind beta options (“ADJ\_U\*” in AERMET and “LOWWIND3” in AERMOD) correct for this over prediction.

The monitoring data collected by Ameren during 2015 reflects a significant over-prediction bias in the AERMOD model absent the low-wind corrections. In fact, QA/QC data collected from air monitors near Labadie and submitted to MDNR reflect air quality well below the 2010 SO2 NAAQs. Put simply, those results should be celebrated by EPA, not discounted or ignored. The low wind model options used by AECOM, as described in the attached materials, have been proposed for acceptance in EPA's pending rulemaking. Once that rulemaking is finalized, the low wind option would be included in the preferred model and

can be used without the need for a Case-by-Case approval.

As the AQAD memorandum makes clear, the participation of the Model Clearinghouse allows for national consistency in approvals and complete transparency with the stakeholder community. Such transparency is particularly important here so that the entire stakeholder community can be assured that regulatory decisions are based on the appropriate technical merits. Accordingly, we hereby request the following: (1) a meeting with USEPA Region VII technical staff as soon as possible to discuss the alternative model demonstration; and (2) so as to assure complete transparency, that Region VII submit the above material and request for Case-By-Case approval to AQAD for review and approval as soon as possible in light of the pending designation decision.

As you are aware, the public comments period terminates in 30 days after publication in the federal register. Accordingly, Ameren is prepared to meet with Agency as soon as possible to discuss this issue.

Note that this information is also supplemented by our submittal made on February 16 that included updated information related to the modeling and monitoring characterization for ambient SO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in the vicinity of the Labadie Energy Center.

Please contact me at your convenience in response to this submittal.

Best Regards,

Steve

.....

steven c. whitworth  
Senior Director  
Environmental Policy and Analysis  
T 314.554.4908  
C 314.488.6460  
F 314.554.4182  
E [SWhitworth@ameren.com](mailto:SWhitworth@ameren.com)<<mailto:SWhitworth@ameren.com>>

.....  
Ameren Services  
1901 Chouteau Avenue  
PO Box 66149, MC 602  
St. Louis, MO 63166-6149  
[Ameren.com](http://www.ameren.com/)<<http://www.ameren.com/>>

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail.

The information contained in this message may be privileged and/or confidential and protected from disclosure. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or an employee or agent responsible for delivering this message to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is

strictly prohibited. Note that any views or opinions presented in this message are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of Ameren. All e-mails are subject to monitoring and archival. Finally, the recipient should check this message and any attachments for the presence of viruses. Ameren accepts no liability for any damage caused by any virus transmitted by this e-mail. If you have received this in error, please notify the sender immediately by replying to the message and deleting the material from any computer. Ameren Corporation